

1st



2018

Theme "Puntland State at Twenty: Transformation to Stability & Good Governance"



Justice and Rule of Law



Public Finance Management



Security Management



Institutions & Capacity Development



Democratization Process

Held @
Puntland State
University

3rd - 5th Aug 2018
Garowe, Puntland

Sponsored and supported by:



ROYAL UNIVERSITY OF
BUSINESS & TECHNOLOGY



Copyright

This work is licensed under
Creative Commons Attribution
NonCommercial License (CC BY-NC 4.0) Attribute to:
Somali Institute for Development & Research Analysis (2018)

The Somali Institute for Development and Research Analysis (SIDRA)
Garowe, Puntland State of Somalia
Telephone: +252-5-846044



Email:
info@sidrainstitute.org



Website:
<http://www.sidrainstitute.org>



SIDRA Facebook:
[facebook.com/SIDRAInstitute](https://www.facebook.com/SIDRAInstitute)



SIDRA Twitter:
[@SIDRAInstitute](https://twitter.com/SIDRAInstitute)

*2018 Summer Dialogues
was made possible through the support and collaboration of:*





Table of Content

<i>2018 Summer Dialogues Highlights</i>	<i>II</i>
<i>About SIDRA</i>	<i>III</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>IV</i>
<i>Key Messages</i>	<i>V</i>
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>01</i>
<i>Keynote Speeches</i>	<i>03</i>
<i>Thematic Presentation</i>	<i>09</i>
<i>Panel Discussions</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>Annexes</i>	<i>25</i>



2018 Summer Dialogues Highlights

The 2018 Summer Dialogues was the first of such dialogues now expected to be held every summer. It has been a valuable summit that attracted the attention of Somali elites, policy makers, local leaders and civil society both inside Somalia and abroad.

Some of the highlights of the summit are as follows:

(1)

The 1st Summer Dialogues took place in Garowe from Friday 3rd to Sunday 5th August 2018 under the theme *“Puntland State at Twenty: Transformation to Stability & Good Governance”*.

(2)

120 participants attended the conference daily, among the participants were: PL government, business community, academia, civil society, and delegations from the federal government of Somalia and other federal member states.

(3)

The Dialogues included 5 keynote speeches, 6 panel discussions, and 7 thematic presentations. These covered four key areas: Good governance, Justice and rule of law, Inclusive politics, and Social development.

(4)

In line with global emerging trends, Social media played a key role allowing the global community to engage with the summit with over 5 million impressions across different Social Media platforms.

(5)

The event will lead to post Summer Dialogues activities and the report and key messages coming from the summit will be disseminated and follow-up public policy forums will be organized at community level.

About SIDRA

The summer dialogue was organized by the Somali Institute for Development Research and Analysis (SIDRA). SIDRA is a private, not-for-profit research and policy analysis think tank established in July 2015 with a primary mission of providing quality research and development services to the public and private entities in Somalia to contribute to the attainment of the development priorities of the country.

The institute is formed by a group of intellectuals, opinion formers, research professionals and practitioners, whose objective is to create new ways to think about and solve the range of complex challenges faced by Somalia, from socio-economic development to climate change through governance reforms. SIDRA wants to offer technical innovative solutions grounded in a process of inclusive change, facilitation, information, communication and reengineering new ways of systems and knowledge-based policy research. SIDRA's aims to build new models that builds on and improves the existing ones.

The institute's research strategy for 2017 to 2021 is based on the major transition that is taking place across the Somali development landscape. To contribute to this transition, the institute is focusing on three broad areas of:

(a) Gender and Women's Empowerment

SIDRA believes that women are key to development and poverty reduction in Somalia. Research and advocacy plans for Somali women's empowerment and greater involvement in decision making remain at the heart of all SIDRA's Gender programme initiatives, through research, networking and capacity strengthening.

(b) Good Governance

Democracy: Somalia is an economy without state. There are structural issues related to the political economy of governance, which touch upon the formulation and operation of the forms of democratic institutions suitable for the local setting and environment to ensure peace, stability and good governance. Critical profiles of this dimension are the institutions and rules to facilitate the smooth conduct of political and economic administration. SIDRA could indeed play a critical role in setting up the institutional infrastructure involving appropriate government

institutions, information base and its utilization for policy.

Rule of law: One critical constraint on the development of Somalia is the threat to peace, security and development because of violent conflict, organized crime, and illegal networks permeating industry and politics. There is an urgent need to undertake evidence-based research on appropriate policy responses to such threats to the development of Somalia. In a similar way, there is a need to support economic institutions to facilitate the functioning of markets in the development process of Somalia. This is an area that would need considerable empirical research.

(c) Social Development

Poverty eradication: Poverty is a major factor hindering citizen participation in all the dimensions of social development. There is a need to estimate and assess the magnitude of poverty, food insecurity, extent of inequality, examine their root causes, guarantee basic needs for all and facilitate the access of the poor to productive resources (e.g. credit, education and training) to promote livelihood opportunities for all.

Education: Inadequate human and institutional capital is a critical constraint on Somali development agenda. SIDRA, as a knowledge hub, provides the know-how for building both human and physical capital. This covers wide range of activities from evaluation of institutional capacity to formulation of strategies, monitoring, implementation and assessing outcomes.

Health: Health is a resource for everyday life hence good health is a major resource for social, economic and personal development and an important dimension of quality of life. Political, economic, social, cultural, environmental, behavioral and biological factors can all favor health or be harmful to it. SIDRA seeks to lay the foundation for the realization of the vision set in the National Development Plan for the health sector of achieving "The highest possible health status, for a healthy and productive nation". SIDRA health research outcomes guides policy and program development as well as delivery of health services.

Acknowledgements

The First Summer Dialogues was not a simple event to hold. Nonetheless, its success was built on a cohesion of teams of elites and policy makers who came together to discuss on the achievements, challenges and way forward for Puntland State as it marked 20 years of existence.

The Dialogues drew key important messages to inform policy and to act as benchmark for other Somalia Federal Member States. We are grateful for everyone's contribution towards this.

First and foremost, I am humbled to extend my sincere gratitude and appreciation to all those that participated in the first Summer Dialogue.

We want to extend our appreciation the major sponsors of the first Summer Dialogues particularly; Diakonia, Gollis Telecom and Royal University of Business and Technology.

It was also such a honour to have the President of Puntland State, Delegates from Somalia Federal Government led by the Prime Minister, the Speaker and Members of Parliament of Puntland State who made the first Summer Dialogue precious.

Allow me to also highly commend the participants from the various regions and corners of Puntland who responded to the call to attend the Summer Dialogues in Garowe. You made us proud.

We also extend our gratitude to Puntland State University for hosting the first Summer Dialogue.

We were also gratified by the support from social media and press journalists, the business community, the participation by Civil Society Organizations, panelists and key note speakers.

I am highly indebted to the staff of Somali Institute for Development Research and Analysis (SIDRA) who made sure that the First Summer Dialogues became a reality. Keep the team spirit.

We have great hopes that you will all continue lending us a hand even in the next Summer Dialogues come 2019.

May Allah reward you all abundantly.

Guled Salah Barre

Executive Director, SIDRA



SIDRA Executive Director, Mr. Guled Salah Barre speaking during the opening ceremony of the 2018 Summer Dialogues

Key Messages

(1) Government Institutions: Over the past 20 years, Puntland has had organized mature institutions with clear structures that have been able to deliver services to the citizens. It is from these that other Federal States have tried to borrow a leaf so as to also improve the efficiency of their institutions. However, the State still experiences a challenge of unclear Terms of Reference for most of its institutions and ministries resulting into mandate conflict and delayed implementation of activities. It was recommended that there should be clear roles and functions assigned to each government institution to overcome this.

It was also noted the compensatory arrangements for government staff are still poor and demotivating. Although there have been strong capacity development plans, most of the competent staff prematurely retire due to low remunerations. In addition to early retirement, other staff quitting to join private sector and international organizations in search for greener pastures. The government should undertake measures to reduce staff turnover such as increasing their remuneration packages.

More still, it was noted that the largest part of the government budget is directed towards recurrent expenditure instead of having more capital expenditure. Thus, the government should re-allocate its resources to ensure that it undertakes more capital investments which can yield higher returns in future. This, in addition to increasing the local revenue base, can help to reduce on overdependence on foreign aid.

(2) Democratization Process: Over a period of 20 years, Puntland has had a stable governance system in which four presidential elections have been held and 5 presidents have managed to transfer power peacefully. This has led to sustainable government institutions which have automatic checks and balances after change of governments, hence improving their efficiency. However, there has been failure by the leaders to push for a structural adjustment reform from a clan-based system to a fully-fledged democratic system where people can exercise their choices by having a one-person one vote general election in which they are able to choose their representatives freely.

The participants of the Dialogue recommended

that Puntland State government and citizens should have this as one of the top priorities which will lead to an organized democratic State which should in a similar way be adopted by both Federal Member States and Federal Government of Somalia.

(3) Fight Against Corruption: Puntland State has managed to establish Puntland Good Governance and Anti-Corruption Bureau and other agencies to fight corruption and embezzlement of public resources. However, there has not been any case of a culprit that has been presented in courts of law to be tried and charged with offences of corruption or mismanagement of office funds and resources.

It was recommended that anti-corruption government authorities and judicial offices should be run independently so that they are free from political influence. This can lead to a larger sense and motivation for transparency amongst government officials.

(4) Security: Security has been one of the key areas in which Puntland has been doing well in the past 20 years. Nonetheless, the sector is still having several challenges that need to be addressed. The government should prioritize the disarmament of the public and reform its security sector through among other ways, training and retraining of security personnel and equipping them with necessary arms to undertake their work effectively. Also, much emphasis should be put on clearing ghost staff from the payroll of the security organs so as to reduce on government expenditure and identify gaps that need more manpower.

(5) Justice and Rule of Law: There has been a judicial sector in Puntland over the past 20 years that has endeavoured to put laws to work. However, due to mistrust in the formal judicial organs, most people resort to informal hearings such as from religious leaders and traditional elders. Massive awareness campaigns and systematic judicial reforms are needed to enhance the efficiency of the judiciary sector and improve the public trust. More so, judicial workers are targeted by assailants like Al-Shabaab and hence government should provide them with adequate security. Their remuneration package is also still poor and requires to be increased to motivate them.

It was also noted that there have been a number of

Key Messages

laws enacted but many have remained inactive over years. There is a need for law enforcement organs to reactive the laws so as to keep law and order in the State.

(6) Social Development: Over the years, there have been improvement in social development which has enhanced the overall growth of Puntland, especially in the education and health sectors. However, there is need to improve on

inclusion of youths, women and marginalized groups in decision making, politics and the economic development process of the state to overcome social inequalities. Similarly, there should be empowerment and extension of services to the needy people especially those in rural areas and among marginalized groups.



President of Puntland State of Somalia H.E. Abdiweli Mohamed Ali Gas speaking during the opening ceremony of the summit



Deputy Prime Minister, H.E. Khadar Gulaid speaking during the open ceremony of the summit



1.1 What are the Summer Dialogues about?

The Summer Dialogues is an annual high-level forum which is an initiative of Somali Institute for Development Research and Analysis (SIDRA). Its major goal is to debate on the challenges that Somalia faces their causes and recommended policy measures to achieve the countries development objectives. It is designed in a manner that allows policy makers, academics, researchers, local leaders, civil society organizations and other key stakeholders to annually come together to debate and present ideas on a selected key theme geared towards transformation of Somalia as a Post Conflict Society. It is from here that policy makers can be able to acquire evidence-based information on which to base developmental initiatives and plans.

The first Summer Dialogues held from 1st to 5th August 2018 at Puntland State University in Garowe came at an opportune time when Puntland State of Somalia was marking twenty years of existence as a semi-autonomous Federal State.

This Dialogue was formulated to discuss the achievements of Puntland in the past twenty years, drawbacks and the way forward. It was built on the theme “Puntland State at Twenty: Transformation to Stability and Good Governance”. It was officially sponsored by Diakonia-Sweden, Gollis and Royal University of Business & Technology.

1.2 Objectives of the 2018 Summer Dialogues

The 2018 Summer Dialogues aimed at bringing together Somali intellectuals, researchers, academicians, policy makers, leaders and local people from all regions to debate and share knowledge and good practices that can contribute to meaningful development in Somalia.

The specific objectives of the Dialogues were to:

- Draw, analyze and share home-grown best practices and lessons learnt from progress made by Puntland's in the past 2 decades with the aim of replicating them in other areas.
- Discuss best ways to impart resilience among citizens and protect and promote human rights in Somalia.

- Discuss the current level of socio-economic development of Puntland and Somalia at large and identify ways in which Somalia's economy can recover and develop.
- Debate on the most appropriate approach of shifting from clan-based governance to a more inclusive democratic system in the whole of Somalia.

The Summit brought together 120 participants including the founding fathers of Puntland, religious leaders, traditional elders, academics, civil society, businessmen, policy makers, local people and government officials from the different regions of Puntland to debate and present ideas on inclusive politics, security, justice, human rights and social development.

The three days' event covered many activities including keynote speeches, paper presentations, panel discussions, Question and Answer sessions and other interactions.

Each day, the program started at 8:00 am in the morning and continued till 3:30 pm in the afternoon. Sessions were organized in three blocks – morning, mid-morning, and afternoon. Each session was vigorous covered and publish on media to reach audience across the globe.

The full three-day program is presented on Annex 1.

2.1 A brief overview of the Summer Dialogues

Presented by Mr. Guled Salah – SIDRA Executive Director

The Executive Director of SIDRA, Mr. Guled Salah Barre gave the welcoming remarks and highlighted SIDRA's expectations emphasizing that the event would give the participants the opportunity to discuss, debate and share experiences about past and contemporary issues on Puntland and Somalia as a whole. He introduced the theme of the summit and hailed all organizations and participants for their support to the Summit.

He contended that, the reality against which the Summit's theme was designed was that twenty years back, Puntland State of Somalia was established following the disintegration of Somalia, which occurred after the civil war that hit the country with the collapse of the central government. As Puntland was marking twenty years, SIDRA institute envisioned a common forum that would bring together intellectuals, researchers, academicians, policy makers, leaders and local people at different levels from Puntland and other Federal States of Somalia. The forum would debate on areas of mutual interest including inclusive politics, security, justice and human rights among others.



Mr. Guled Salah, SIDRA Executive Director addressing summit participants

He further noted that since its establishment, Puntland has held 4 presidential peaceful elections to uphold the values of democracy but has also encountered several setbacks. The summer dialogue

would give participants the opportunity to discuss home-grown best practices and lessons from Puntland as it marks 20 years of existence and chat a way forward on how such practices can be spread to the rest of the country. He added that, from The Summer Dialogues' concept paper, a lot of information was embedded including how in the past years, other regional governments have been established following the footsteps of Puntland which maintains its position as a member state in the Federal government.

It was noted that Puntland is thus the oldest and most experienced Federal State of Somalia whose best practices needed to be benchmarked and spread to other regions. In concluding his speech, he acknowledged the support from different organizations including Diakonia-Sweden, Royal University of Business and Technology, Gollis Telecom, Puntland State University, civil society organizations, government leaders from Puntland, Federal Government and other member states and all other organizations and individuals who made the summit a reality.

2.2 Representation from Funders

Presented by Mrs. Muna Yusuf – Diakonia Puntland Programme Coordinator

Diakonia which was one of the sponsors of the event was represented by Mrs. Muna Yusuf, Program Coordinator – Puntland. She revealed that, Diakonia-Sweden started its operation in Somalia in 1994 and was the first international organization to settle in Puntland. It engaged itself in supporting the needy people and communities especially IDPs who migrated to Puntland during the civil war.

Diakonia was quoted to have contributed a lot in the implementation of humanitarian and developmental programmes extending its services to several remote areas of Puntland. It is believed to have done a lot in helping IDPs, drought interventions, strengthening judicial programmes, human rights as well as supporting Puntland democratization process.

On concluding her speech, she thanked the organizers and participants of the Summer Dialogues and emphasized that the Summit was important as it rotated around challenges, achievements and the



Some officials and participants of the Summer Dialogues pose for a group photo



Women participants follow presentations at the Summer Dialogues

way forward for the growth of Puntland State and Somalia as a whole.



Mrs Muna Yusuf, Diakonia Program Coordinator, Puntland addressing summit participants

2.3 The Founding of Puntland State of Somalia

Presented by Abbas Ahmed – Senior Researcher

In his speech on the founding of Puntland State of Somalia, Abbas Ahmed, a senior researcher focused on two important stages that marked the birth of Puntland. These were particularly before the period between 1991 and 1998 prior to its establishment and after 1998 when the state was formally established.

First Stage (1991-1998) – North East Somalia

It was noted that, before the birth of Puntland State, the north-east regional administration was operational but with no clear and strong governance system. This arose because of the central government's failure to plan for the country and hence there were no signs of a brighter future. The challenges faced during this stage included:

- Great fear that the Civil War in the South would spread North Eastwards especially to the Mudug region.
- Eruption of an armed conflict between SSDF troops and Al-Itihad Militia groups who were controlling the port of Bosaso.
- Disintegration and bitter power struggle between the two SSDF factions, one led by General Mohamed Abshir and the other by Colonel Abdullahi Yusuf.

Establishment of a civil administration called North East Administration consisting of Mudug, Nugaal and Bari regions; and (2) SSDF was limited to the defense role and representation of the administration in external missions. Between February – March 1998, another meeting was held in Garowe. This meeting preceded the final conference that marked the birth of Puntland. In it, the delegates agreed on the procedures that were to be followed in the final consultative meeting.

Between May and July 1998, the final consultative meeting was held in Garowe for which the main outcome was the establishment of Puntland State of Somalia. The major reason behind the success of these meetings was the fact that they were transparent, and the selection of participants was done with maximum equity with representation from each clan. This made the struggle to be of collective efforts and eventually a state was born.



Abbas Ahmed, Senior Researcher presenting a keynote speech during the summit

Second Stage: The early period after the birth of Puntland

In the final consultative meeting, delegates from five regions (Mudug, Nugal, Bari, Sool and Sanaag) and Buhodle district formed the new administration. On 1st August 1998, delegates elected Abdullahi Yusuf as the President and Mohamad AbdiHashi as the Vice President of Puntland State of Somalia. Upon Yusuf's election, 9 ministries were formed, and former militia groups were integrated to form one security force for the state to ease the administration of the new state. This was when a fully-fledged government system was launched after eight years of consultative meetings and dialogues by different sectors of the community.

2.4 The Achievements and Shortcomings of Puntland after 20 years

Presented by Mohamed Yusuf - Senior Researcher

Consultative Conferences

The first consultative meeting took place in Galkayo on February 1991, the main outcome of this conference was to restore SSDF as an administration for the North East Regions. Another meeting was held on mid 1991 in Garowe and the outcomes were: (1)

Puntland State is the regional state with the best governance system among all other Federal States. This has been because of the combined efforts of businessmen, government, and traditional and religious leaders. Puntland has gone through five administrations, four parliamentary assemblies, four judiciary, three development plans and three consultative meetings.



Mohamed Yusuf, Head of Puntland Human Rights Defenders Office presenting a keynote speech during the summit

Building Puntland governmental institutions

Puntland Institutions took time to be built and the institutions we know today were not present at the establishment in 1998. The 1998 government was composed of the President, Vice President, 9 Ministries, and 4 Deputy Ministers appointed later. The government of 2018 has a total of 19 Ministers, 35 Deputy Ministers, the President and Vice president. There were only 700 civil servants then compared to 7,500 today. The State was being run on a budget of about USD 1.2 million compared to USD 170 million in the present day.

Peace and security

The element of peace continues to be a priority for Puntland, as the citizens are of peaceful nature. However, there are still some challenges of attacks from Al-Shabaab and the recurring conflicts with Galmudug and Somaliland administrations. Although the department of security exists; there is still no accountable and transparent system. Besides those mentioned above, the following are the challenges faced by security forces in Puntland: Weapons in public hands, Clan-based troops and un-authorized troops, and Weak relationship between security forces and citizens.

Achievements

During these past 20 years, the achievements of Puntland State are many and include new economic hubs in Bosaso and Garowe, roads built in 43 major

cities, completion of Bosaso and Garowe airports, many water wells dug in remote areas among other development initiatives completed. Also mentioned by researcher Mohamed, there are around 13 universities now while there were none before and 900 schools while there were only 30 before. Health services improved with the installation of 300 health care facilities, while there were only 30 before. Finally, youth and women centers have been created.

Shortcomings

Mohamed Yusuf also highlighted the shortcomings of Puntland after 20 years. These include: (1) Lack of developmental plans and visions in which the public and government cooperate, (2) 1998 agreement of creating political parties still not in place, (3) Constitutional Court has not yet been formed, (4) Delays in the democratization process, (5) Mismanagement of public finances and public resources, (6) Recurrent internal conflicts, (7) Weapons in the hands of the community, (8) Limited reach of basic services to many needy remote communities, and (9) Social crises such as piracy, illegal immigration, khat, corruption and abuse of power in many times.

2.5 Representation from the Federal Government of Somalia

Presented by Mr. Mahdi Mohamed Gulaid - Deputy Prime Minister of Somalia

Hon. Mahdi Guled observed that the Deputy Prime Minister of the Federal Government of Somalia whose was overjoyed by the initiative to have the Summer Dialogues. Mr. Mahdi Mohamed representing both the President of Somalia and the Prime Minister in the summit. He congratulated Puntland on marking its 20th peaceful year of existence.



Deputy Prime Minister, H.E. Khadar Gulaid presenting keynote speech during the summit

He emphasized that the federal government and

other federal member states must learn from the political stability and accountability of government institutions in Puntland. In addition, there was emphasis on the importance of home grown solutions to growth and prosperity and embraced Puntland as being a great example whose success stories need to be emulated by other Federal Member States.

He also envisaged the role of federalism in the country's growth. Federalism had already and is still producing good fruits for Puntland especially through the decentralization system of governance in which services are easily extended to local communities including rural areas. It is important to see what worked for the central government as well as the federal member states to reach a functional and transparent working environment. "I believe that 'Nabad iyo Nolol' peace and prosperity is in Puntland as it was the center of the founding of the Somali government in 1960", lamented the Prime Minister.

He added that, social reconciliation is highly pertinent towards the achievement of stability in any economy and envisaged Puntland to have taken tireless efforts to achieve this despite some challenges. More so, the aspect of peace building and sustainable development through cooperation, brotherhood and dialogues between all federal states members, especially Puntland and Somaliland over Tukaraq conflict would be resolved through creating avenues for reconciliation among these states.

2.6 The Speaker of Puntland Parliament

Presented by Hon. Ahmed Hashi - Speaker of the Puntland Parliament

Hon. Ahmed Hashi observed that Puntland's existence and priorities came from consultations and co-operation between the administration and the people of Puntland. It is due to the difficulties faced by the people of Puntland that the state was established.

He observed that, although Puntland has not reached a one person -one vote system because of several existing reasons such as lack of civic education and recurrent conflicts, summits like the Summer Dialogues with such a type of debates should be held frequently and the recommendations that come out of them shared among Federal Member States to reach admirable levels of growth and development.

In his speech, he also added that a good number of laws have been enacted by Parliament which is a sign of improvement in the rule of law. It was also added that, there has been enhancement of accountability in the public sector under the oversight of the

parliament. He also asked the community members and policy makers to advocate for these debates and hailed the organizers for presenting such a summit to reflect on the achievements and challenges of the past 20 years.



Mr. Ahmed Ali Hashi, Speaker of the Puntland State Parliament presenting a keynote speech during the summit

The speaker concluded that, since the foundation of Puntland, there has been major and significant progress and had great hopes that this will continue to be achieved even in future.

2.7 The President of Puntland State

Presented by H.E. Abdiweli Mohamed Ali – President of Puntland

The President highly thanked the organizers of the summit and the participants. He also hailed the role played by the founding fathers of Puntland State whose works are still commemorated.



H.E. Abdiweli Mohamed Ali Gas, President of Puntland State of Somalia presenting keynote speech during the summit

He argued that, Puntland State was established for reasons among others; (i) The need to build a peaceful State free from conflicts, (ii) The desire to have a well-organized governance system and functional government institutions, (iii) The need to

achieve sustainable growth and development, and (iv) The need to seek the establishment of a federal government for Somalia.

He contended that, Puntland had played a key role in the politics of Somalia as other Federal States emulate and benchmark the leadership styles of Puntland to also achieve remarkable progress. He added that, Puntland regions were termed as 'The unreachable regions' before 1991 until thousands of people started fleeing from the civil war in Mogadishu. Currently, many IDPs have settled and work from Puntland.

The president added that, there are several achievements which Puntland has had for the last 20

years such as the remarkable improvement in peace and stability, strengthening of functioning government institutions, and development of infrastructure among many others. Despite all these, there are still challenges especially Al-Shabaab, limited government revenue, prolonged droughts among others which need to be addressed by the government with cooperation of the citizens, religious and traditional leaders and civil society organizations among others.

He concluded by asking organizers to continue having such forums and debates that can promote growth and development of Puntland and Somalia as a whole.



Ali Haji Warsame and Mohamed Farah Isse (Gashan) sharing some words during the Summer Dialogues



Panel discussion participant shares her thoughts during a panel discussion session

3.1 Public perception, attitude and experience on corruption and accountability

Presented by Dr Bashir Sheekh Mohamed, Senior Researcher

Dr. Bashir first observed that this important and comprehensive research project is part of a broader initiative which is aiming to help people in Puntland discuss and debate about corruption within government agencies and civil society, which in return will strengthen transparency and accountability in Somalia. The research was conducted in three main regions of Puntland: Mudug, Nugaal and Bari. The main components of the research were: (a) Public opinion survey targeting the urban population of five main cities of Bosaso, Qardho, Garowe, Galkaacyo and Galdogob in the above named regions, (b) in-depth individual expert interviews (KIIs) through which more than three dozen sectoral experts (i.e. experts from public, private and civil society sectors) have been interviewed, and (c) Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) held in all three target regions.

After discussion the methodology and aim of this study, the researcher gave a general introduction about corruption and accountability in Puntland and Somalia. Indeed, corruption and the absence of culpability were already commonplace on the Somali peninsula before the implosion of Somalia's central government in 1991; however, the civil war destroyed the public institutions and the rule of law. Subsequently, competing individual and selfish group interests of a myriad of rival actors have created havoc and fuelled instability, widespread corruption and gross violations of human rights. While Puntland has administrations that brought about peace and stability, on the other hand, they have not been able to build effective public institutions that could satisfactorily deliver basic public services or fight against corruption. In addition, the underpinning factors of the "corruption culture" in Somalia are also found in Puntland.

Moving on to the research findings, the researcher focused on public perception on corruption, transparency, and accountability in Puntland. A relative majority of the surveyed urban population thought that the rule of law in Puntland was either

weak or very weak (54.7%); and their perception on corrupt institution lead to a fifty-two per cent of those interviewed saying the public sector is the most corrupt compared to the private and Civil Society sectors, only 11% believed that the private sector was the most corrupt. Belief is also that corruption in Puntland was as high as the rest of Somalia constituted 53%, and 13% of those interviewed believed that the level of corruption was higher in Puntland, and 37% of the panel were of the opinion that the level of corruption was lower in Puntland. When considering equal rights, 46% believe that "Puntland citizens have equal rights regardless of their clan or wealth status"; a minority of 27% believed that Puntland citizens have same rights irrespective of clan affiliation or wealth status.



Dr Bashir Sheekh Mohamed (Senior Researcher) making a presentation on public perception and attitude and experience on corruption and accountability

The root cause of corruption is believed to be debilitated governmental capacity, greed, a loose and ineffective rule of law, widespread poverty, established cultural behaviors and local customs, and a lack of political will to criminalize or fight corruption as needed.

The perceived consequences of corruption were found to include a loss of trust in public institutions (28%), inadequate socioeconomic development (20.5%), injustice and increased conflicts (19.2%), and the perpetuation of corruption (12%) as people become desensitized to its existence and effects.

Other key findings from the KIIs and FGDs were; The process through which the Members of Parliament and other senior government officials are appointed

is deeply flawed and far from being based on merit, In Somalia, including Puntland, public officials perceive public assets entrusted to them as their own private property. There is common agreement among the experts interviewed that there is little or no accountability in Puntland. In addition to the lack of accountability and transparency, there is near total impunity for transgressors as corrupt individuals and institutions are not legally prosecuted which propagates the vicious cycle of the lack of transparency, corruption and misappropriation of public resources. It is almost impossible to hold politicians and other public officials accountable in cases of corruption or public money embezzlement, and finally public finance management (PFM) has historically been very problematic and remains so today.

In his conclusion, Dr. Bashir made some key recommendations to the public, private and civil society sectors, and international aid agencies:

- Address the situation of accountability, corruption and transparency, starting from top political leadership,
- Need for a comprehensive, effective and inclusive anti-corruption strategy,
- Install checks and balances mechanisms,
- Introduce a credible and truly democratic multi-party-political system to get away from the unfair, non-transparent and highly unaccountable clan-based political system,
- Show greater ownership and care for the collective public interest without which only narrow personal or sectoral profits would not get the sector too far,
- Comply with the existing laws and be proactive when it comes to the payment of taxes,
- Look beyond the prevailing project-seeking-mentality by truly aligning with and advocating for the public interest,
- Keep a “safe distance” from the government to maintain an undisputable position of political neutrality and integrity,
- Conduct a reality check on the ground by strengthening effective adherence to ethical and anti-corruption codes of conduct by both international and national staff alike,
- Refrain from channeling aid funds to private accounts of line Ministries that are controlled by few individuals,

- Setup a better and more effective monitoring and evaluation system, and
- Be accountable not only to the distant donors, but also to the state and individuals who are meant to be the beneficiaries of the aid.

3.2 The role of judiciary in combating corruption in puntland

Presented by Sh. Mohamed Omar - Member of Somalia High Judiciary Council

Mohamed Omar began this presentation with an introduction about corruption, indeed Somalia is described as the worst country in terms of corruption, it has occupied the bottom of the TI list exclusively for years.

Moving on to the purpose of the paper and its methodology, Mohamed Omar says that the intended purpose was to assess the current situation of the judicial systems in Puntland /Somalia in relation to the fight against corruption activities and also to consider the efficiency of existing legislation on investigation, prosecution and conviction of activities related to corruption, as well as identifying obstacles that hinder institutions of justice from curbing corruption. The researcher selected a 25-member sample of law enforcement personnel in Puntland, namely the Office of the Auditor-General, the Public Prosecution, the Anti-Corruption Office, the judges of the courts, the Investigative Police, the Bar Association and independent legal experts for information that helps to uncover the reality.



Sheek Mohamed Omar (Member of Somali Higher Judiciary Council) making a presentation on the role of judiciary in combatting corruption in Puntland

Researcher Mohamed discussed the findings of the study, as he revealed that the independence of the judiciary was a separate issue from the adequacy of legislation. Most participants agreed that good legislation and good implementation were separate issues. This means, to some extent, that legislation on

the investigation and prosecution of offenders is available in Puntland/Somalia, but the political commitment and implementation of this legislation is the real problem.

The issue of corruption is directly linked to the rule of law. Corruption is more common in the executive branch. The most striking aspect is that the government does not comply with the budget approved by parliament. Moreover, most of the interviewees did not rule out corruption in government institutions. Many of them said, "It is widespread among senior officials at the top of the hierarchy of power, including ministers, directors of government agencies and provincial governors." The study conducted by PSU University confirmed this perception among the citizens of Puntland.

Law enforcement agencies including the police, Auditor General, the prosecution, the courts and the Prisons Service are institutions supposed to play a primary role to combat corruption. Although these institutions are in place, they suffer from poor efficiency, despair of reform, fear of adventure in reform and prefer to stay in the safety zone for fear of the unknown. So they need to charge their own, and build capacity. It is clear that the anti-corruption institutions such as the public prosecutor, the GO and the public accountant are so fragile that one of the interrogators dared to say that these offices are mere names that do not fulfill their constitutional powers. After the law has lost its authority and prestige, the public auditor and the prosecutor's office no longer dare to charge.

With regard to the adequacy of existing legislation, respondents felt that the current legislation on many aspects of the investigation and prosecution of corruption-related activities was sufficient, with minor exceptions requiring further elaboration, demystification and the definition of legal terminology.

The study also highlighted the challenges Puntland judiciary face as, but not limited to the following; there are conflicting and contradictory legal traditions, unqualified individuals, lack of equipment and resources, restrictions on the independence of the judiciary, clan impunity and the non-help social environment, political and financial challenges.

Finally, from the study, Mohamed Omar gave several recommendations that need to be taken to improve the role of judicial systems so that it could play its intended role. These recommendations are the following:

- Political commitment is indispensable. Throughout all levels of government, this is a

crucial condition for achieving comprehensive institutional reforms. Particularly creating accountable and transparency systems and curbing corruption.

- The need for a strong coordination between the institutions of justice, namely the police, the prosecution and the court to ensure that the proceedings proceed to a smooth and agreeable conclusion of the proceedings.
- Raising the level of education of citizens and officials is the best way to bring about change and reform of public institutions, a senior official argued that there is a relationship between the corruption of the person and the level of education, the higher the level of education there is a strong likelihood of low corruption.

3.3 Puntland Justice - challenges and opportunities

Presented by Salim Said Salim - Senior Researcher

In his introduction, the researcher presented that, a critical measure of the transitional administration of war torn country is its success in providing security and the rule of law to its people. These can only be realized when there are functioning institutions to uphold them. Somalia's legal, judicial and law enforcement institutions collapsed during the civil war. Rebuilding government institutions and restoring law and order has been a daunting task in Puntland. Since 1998, there have been efforts to reestablish the foundations of the judicial system: legal codes, courts, jails and law enforcement agencies but that the sector continues to face a range of obstacles in establishing independent, fair and efficient services.



Salim Said Salim (Senior Lawyer and Consultant) making a presentation on Puntland justice challenges and opportunities

However, notwithstanding these difficulties, there have been promising changes, such as the graduation of new law professionals from the universities to replace the old judges and those with the informal legal education and the appointment, in 2016, of new chief justice and members of the high judiciary council. These developments, and existing positive practices, can be built upon to strengthen the role of the judiciary, the Attorney General's Office and the Ministry of Justice (MoJ) in making formal justice a reliable system people can trust.

Mr. Salim also gave an overview of Puntland judiciary sector, explaining that the Constitution of Puntland of 2012 (article 89-107) established the Judiciary as an independent third organ of government. The Chief Justice is the head of the Judiciary and is responsible for its effective and efficient administration. He then moved to citing and giving the roles of the different organs composing the judiciary. The presenter shared the following challenges regarding Puntland judiciary:

- Poor funding, leading to delays in salaries and demotivated staff,
- Limited qualified judges and prosecutors and lack of specialized training and continued legal education,
- Selection and employment of judges is sometimes conducted without following proper recruitment procedures and without setting the minimum qualifications,
- Lack of public trust and confidence in the justice system, thus, most people in Puntland resort to the traditional or sharia system of justice,
- There is huge challenge relating to transportation and other office equipment and working conditions of some courts and attorney general offices, and
- The judge crafts skills including statutory interpretation; judicial ethics; evidence; disclosure; case management; controlling the court; judgment writing, and sentencing are in adequate despite the increase in judges with law or Shari'a degrees in the system.

As in other parts of Somalia, Puntland is in a state of legal pluralism where customary law (Xeer), religious law (Sharia) and secular law operate. Among the three, Xeer is the dominant system that governs societal relations. The substantive law is also applied in Puntland as the first Puntland charter provided that “laws and regulations legally enacted by the previous

governments provisionally remain in force until they are replaced by new legislation”. The third legal source is the Sharia, which is the supreme law in Puntland.

The presentation ended with recommendations, summarized below:

- Social and political transformation is needed to foster holistic judiciary reform,
- Evaluation and monitoring (inspection scheme) of performance of judges and prosecutors should be put in place,
- Provide judges and prosecutors with a high degree of protection from the public persecution,
- Ensure law reform through enhancing capacity of MOJRAR and solicitor General to gazette laws properly,
- Ensure independence of the judiciary through ensuring financial autonomy,
- Enhancing skills and knowledge of judges and prosecutors and establishing transparent selection process,
- High judiciary council should have report unit to publish court decisions, and
- Providing adequate financial, technical and logistic support for judiciary or establishing judiciary fund.

3.4 Conflict management in post-conflict societies

Presented by Ahmed Sheekh Mohamud - Former Ambassador and Lecturer at PSU

Diplomat Ahmed began his speech with stressing the importance of dialogue in conflict resolution, indeed dialogue is an overwhelming tool used by all humans when there is a disagreement or conflict between them. Furthermore, when dialogue is initiated, it doesn't mean resolution will be automatic, however it shows the readiness for an agreement. Rebuilding a nation after civil war, the case of Somalia, requires peace and reconciliation. Ahmed adds, this is the only way to development, a divided society cannot stand together, even less so if there is hate and vengeance between them.

Unfortunately says the diplomat, Somalis are not ready to heal and reconcile. With people of the same ethnic group, same religion, and the same cultural background, one would think that healing and reconciliation would be an easy process. However, it seems like tribalism is stronger than ever in Somalia.

Sometimes adds the presenter, a conflict can lead to

positivity with change of governance, freedom from oppression, and better system in place. The Somali issue can only be handled through cooperation, forgiveness and moving on.



Ahmed Sheik Mohamud (Former Ambassador and Lecturer at Puntland State University) making presentation on conflict management in post-conflict societies

Before dealing with people who came out of suffering and war, the public needs to understand the three stages of war: 1) It sparks, 2) It is felt, 3) and finally it breaks. Somalia's problems must be resolved without compromising on what is happening in the community. No matter what happens, we will not find a solution if we do not address the underlying problems within the community.

Ahmed concluded with "I want Somalis to follow the path to recovery, healing and reconciliation that Rwanda followed".

3.5 Puntland Education Development

Mohamed Ali Farah, Director General of the Ministry of Education

The Director General started with a general introduction. The department of Education and Higher Education was founded in 1998. The ministry has gone through various stages: when Puntland was founded, education was part of the Ministry of Social Affairs which also included health. That Ministry had one Minister and two Director Generals for Health and Education. Also, the department of Education consisted of three subdivisions: Education, Non-formal education, and Monitoring and Evaluation. It is only in 2002 that the Ministry of Social Affairs was split into two ministries: Ministry of Education and Ministry of Health. During this time, the Ministry managed only five high schools, legacy of the former central government.

Afterwards, Mohamed cited several regulations and laws the Ministry put in place regarding Education; he insisted that these laws were inexistent before. From 2002 to 2008, the ministry started work to facilitate

educational quality. The first step planned was to centralize examinations in only 4 high schools in Galkayo, Garowe, Gardo and Bossaso. The ministry then proceeded to unify the curriculum and the standard of high school education. From 2009, a centralized examination started in all schools of Puntland.

The ministry finally expanded its education services and has been implementing educational institutions. These include 732 primary schools, 96 high schools and 13 universities. The number of teachers in primary and secondary schools are 4,497, while upper secondary schools are covered by 989 teachers. There are 932 lecturers teaching in the universities. The number of pupils studying in elementary schools is 153,108, for secondary schools 25,116, and 13,214 in universities.

As part of quality control, the Ministry put in place a framework of the Puntland education curriculum, which has resulted in getting rid of the systems and curriculums borrowed from neighboring countries during the beginning of the ministry. All regions and districts of Puntland have set up offices to work on education development. The ministry established the second five-year Education Plan for the years 2017-2021. The DG stressed the participation of primary and secondary schools all over Puntland and noted that the wages of teachers have also been increased.



Mohamed Ali Farah (Director General of Puntland Ministry of Education) making a presentation on Puntland Education Development

The presentation concluded with a list of challenges faced by the ministry including:

- Finalization of the curriculums, both student books and lecturer's books.
- Lack of funds, especially during examination periods which requires extra funding.
- Lack of space in the Ministry to fit all the staff.

3.6 Gender in Higher Education in Puntland

Presented by Dr. Amina Jama Mohamud - Director of Research at SIDRA Institute

Amina Jama commenced her presentation on the status of education in Puntland followed by the challenges faced by women in Higher Education Institutions (HEIs).

Puntland has 14 HEIs consisting of 11 universities, one teacher's college, one veterinary college and one unspecified college. Total student population is 11,554 (2016). The total undergraduate enrolment in Puntland is growing at an average annual growth rate of 52.7%, 2013/14 and 2015/16. Females' account for a higher growth in enrolment rate at 56.8% compared to 50.3% of males (2015-16).



Dr. Amina Jama Mohamud (Director of Research at SIDRA Institute) making a presentation on Gender in Higher Education in Puntland

These positive figures have also a downside including challenges faced by women and girls. The study highlighted major challenges summarized below:

- Lack of data on gender inequality in terms of access, attrition and retention at different levels within the education system,
- Attitudes of parents and peers on gender stereotypes including the attitudes of teachers,
- Pre-existing inequalities,
- Lack of role models; limited guidance and mentorship,
- Lack or inadequate security,
- Long distances between residential areas and HEIs deter many girls, especially girls from rural, low-income families, from attending higher education,
- Government policies promote girl's enrollment but no follow-ups,

- Research not valued nor prioritized and lacks infrastructure, funding and policy,
- Poor or lack of implementation of affirmative action. For example, in 2007, the Puntland government endorsed a strategy for changing the recruitment system to increase the number of qualified women hired, in line with the Presidential Decree of 2007.65 which has a 30% quota for women in public administration,
- Lack of gender sensitive physical and psychosocial environments. For example, lack of facilities; toilets, dustbins for sanitary pads, restrooms/staffroom for female staff,
- Poor psychosocial environment includes physical, social and sexual harassment, discrimination and bullying of girls,
- Insufficient local policies and action plans to promote the advancement of women in careers within HEI and lack of supportive environment to ensure that highly-qualified women participate fully, in the decision-making processes in HEI,
- Lack or insufficient scholarships for female students, especially those from poor families
- Poor systematic control of the quality of formal and informal education to explore factors that hinder or promote a real gender-sensitive context, and
- Lack of scientific studies exploring gender and the job market includes research to understand the socio-economic environment and access to specific occupations, and the enabling context that can harness the capacities and full potential of women

The study highlighted key Policy Messages

- Put in place gender-sensitive recruitment and promotion process in HEIs.
- Establish new or strengthen existing bodies to implement and monitor the impact of the higher education policy,
- Initiate systematic research on higher education,
- Strengthen the implementation of local and international scholarship programmes,
- Accelerate gender policy dissemination and translation,
- Initiate and enhance deliberate policy

provision to ensure that HEIs environment is sensitive to the needs of female students and lecturers, and

- Initiate a community awareness programme to mitigate negative stereotypical attitudes toward women and education

3.7 Status of health sector before and after establishment of Puntland

Presented by Abdirizaq Abshir H. - Ministry of Health

The speaker commenced with 1991 when the Somali government collapsed, and with it, the health system disintegrated. There were no salaries, no supplies, and no services. The only functioning institutions were emergency services in few hospitals run by international agencies. The speaker then presented the differences in the health facilities from 1998 to 2018; where there were no district hospitals while there are 17 now, the number of health centers increased by 544%, indicating the number of health centers has increased five-fold. 192 new primary health care units have been established.



Abdirizak Abshi (Director of Primary Health Department of Puntland Ministry of Health) making a presentation on status of health sector before and after establishment of Puntland

Continuing with the achievements, the service delivery has also improved with maternity wards, stabilization centers, medicine and pediatric wards, lab, X-ray, Ultrasound, pharmacies, counseling centers and other facilities provided to the patients. The Ministry created many policies and key strategies to improve governance and leadership, including health sector strategic plan including 10 Puntland policies and strategies and 15 nation-wide policy documents. These include essential Package of Health Services (EPHS) Framework, Medicines policy and Standard Treatment Guideline, Reproductive Health (RH) Strategy and Plan, Human Resource for Health' Policy and Plan, Expanded program of immunization (EPI) Policy, and Nutrition strategy and plan.

The speaker concluded with major challenges the Ministry and the Health departments are facing including:

- Limited budget and poor service provision in non - EPHS regions (Sool and Sanag and Ayn),
- Neglected secondary level services (Hospitals) and shortage of referral services (facility & ambulances),
- Poor health and nutrition services for IDPs and nomadic population,
- Interruption of supplies, medicines and commodities and questionable quality of drugs, and
- Poor enforcement of policies

Puntland health sector human resource in 1998 and at present

Human resources in the health sector		
	1998	2017/2018
MoH (Central)	15	110
Regional health management teams	8	90
Regional hospitals	199	566
District hospitals / Referral Health Centers	0	732
Health Centers	49	876
Primary Health Unit	0	584
TBM Bosasso	10	176
VCTs	0	30



Panel 1 (Puntland democratization process): From left: Dr. Mohamed Dahir Afrah, Historian; Abdirahman Sheekh Ahmed, Minister of Labour, Youth and Sports; Mohamed Yusuf, Head of Puntland Human Rights Defender's Office; Shamsu Sheekh Hassan, lawyer; Jamila Said Muse, Former Minister



Panel 2 (Transparency and the fight against corruption among public Institutions) - From left: Abduqadir Abdikhadar, Director of International Relations at East Africa University; Dr. Bashir Sheekh Mohamed, Senior Researcher; Abdullahi Farah Mire [Moderator], University of Malai; Abdirahman Ali Gureye, Director General of PL Good Governance and Anti-Corruption Bureau; Mohamed Omar, Member of Somali High Judiciary Council

4.1 Panel 1: Puntland democratization process

Key messages

There is still challenge of low levels democracy in Puntland State of Somalia: The rule of law and governance is based on culture and clan sentiments. This is what governs society and hence and there are still gaps in building a democratic system. There are still contradictions between the government, culture and clannism which make the achievement of democracy difficult. Despite Puntland having had 5 presidents, democracy is still not yet fully manifested and exercised.

The panelists unanimously agreed that one of the most important features of democracy, people's choice, is missing. All last presidents of Puntland have pledged to install a system where the public elect their leaders through "one person one vote" elections. Promises were made to put aside the clan-based selections, but all in vain. It is still doubtful if Puntland State can hold and manage a general election because of major issues, such as politicians not willing to install a system that will strip them of their powers. If universal suffrage is not possible for the next presidential elections, the panel argued that it is better to start with district level elections and in the future, presidential elections will also be held with one man one vote system.

Open discussions and recommendations

The participants in the panel were involved in open discussion resulting in the following recommendations:

- Reaching full democracy in Puntland is not a choice, it is mandatory. All present government leaders should advocate for full democracy in the State where rule of law is respected, and people are free to exercise their choices without influence from clan leaders or cultural constraints.
- Puntland needs to create public awareness on democracy, elections, and good governance. There is a need for high levels of civic education in order to enable citizens beware of the meaning of democracy, elections and good governance. This is what

may help the public to have high interest in building democratic systems within their state. It is only when individuals get to know of the importance of such, that they can start collectively asking for the same.

- The fight against corruption needs to be won to have democracy. As corruption and lower levels of accountability remain in Puntland despite the improvement in the fight against it, democracy will not be achieved when such things like bribery and embezzlement of public resources still exist.
- Create approaches to address the question of transparency and accountability. Like the above, the mode and system of reporting is still poor with unclear monitoring and evaluation channels which limit the level of transparency and accountability. Therefore, there should be an improvement in the reporting system in order to promote accountability for public funds.
- Need for consensus on what democracy entitles in Puntland. The panel also agreed that there is no need to agree on what democracy would mean to Puntland. There should only be a focus to build a state in which democracy is the first aspect to consider in governance.
- All the members of society need to be represented. There should be representation of all members of the society in parliament, ministries and local government levels especially for women, youths and the marginalized groups of people. This would help to overcome inequalities and also to promote human rights in Puntland.

4.2 Panel 2: Transparency and the fight against corruption among public Institutions

Key messages

More than half (55%) of Somalis depend on foreign aid and basic services required from government are limited. There is need to debate on where the taxes and revenues of the country go, as answering this question opens the door to fighting corruption. The

panel revealed the major reasons behind the existence of high levels of corruption in Puntland including conspiracy by government officials, unclear system of hiring staff, lack of public participation in follow up on the government funds and generally a weak system of internal controls within ministries and government agencies.

There are rules and laws that can be put in place to prosecute any action of corruption but the fight against corruption is not a one man's struggle. Every member of the society is duty bound to fight against corruption. The judiciary only becomes effective in its fight against corruption when it gets support from other governmental agencies and the citizens. It is importance of having a leadership that is devoted towards combatting corruption and creating public awareness on corruption.

The panel reminded the public that Puntland is the only entity with a good governance and anti-corruption bureau in Somalia although the element of corruption still exists.

Open discussions and recommendations

The discussions of the panel generated the following remarks and recommendations:

- Abolition of a clan-based system of appointing leaders. If Puntland, and Somalia as a whole is to fight against corruption, efforts should start with the change of the clan-based selection process of members of Parliament. Indeed, having a parliament fully accountable to its people would be effective in this fight.
- The Anti-Corruption Bureau should be independent from government. Puntland good governance and anti-corruption bureau needs to operate as an independent body such that government officials who engage in corruption practices can easily be indicted without any political influence and intimidation or conflict of interest.
- Strengthening public awareness on corruption and its negative effects on the economy. One must feel it is his and her duty to participate in this effort, starting by staying far from corruption, and denouncing it. The citizens of Puntland must see corruption as an evil limiting their development. This can be achieved if there is improvement in the awareness against it.
- Youth and women, as they are a big portion of the community, need to join in the anti-

corruption campaign. There should be inclusion of women and youths in the fight against corruption as these forms a larger part of the population in Puntland and Somalia at large.

- Training of professional civil servants who are able to observe professional ethical standards and principles. In every position such as offices for Ministers and Local government, especially those dealing with finance and accountability, there should be well trained personnel who cannot easily be manipulated as they must follow their professional code of conduct. This would help to curb down corruption in Puntland State.

4.3 Panel 3: Justice, humanitarian situation, and human rights in Puntland

Key messages

There has been an improvement in the respect for human rights although different forms of justice are employed in dealing with any form of human rights violation. The panel pointed out that the courts operate within 29 districts of Puntland and that selection of Puntland Attorneys, Judges and Attorney General is based on education and merit. Indeed, 65% of those who are selected have studied law. Puntland's Office of the Prosecutor was founded in 1998 and is an independent office.

The question of women rights was highlighted with the observation that in 2015, Puntland adopted the Puntland Rape Act, which facilitated the trial of rape cases in formal courts. The duties of the prosecution authorities were addressed in cases where the accused is charged with a sexual offence. The Attorney general will prosecute, and the Somali Penal Code shall not apply to rape cases. The prosecution authorities are also required to forbid traditional elders or any other authority or person to take any measures to resolve any offence prescribed under the Act, using the traditional or any other informal dispute resolution mechanism. This means that traditional mechanism is not to be used to resolve rape cases anymore. Puntland government adoption of the Sexual Offences Act is first of its kind in Somalia and hence paves way for the reduction of sexual harassment against women and girls.

Open discussion and recommendations

Responding to questions posed by the participants in the open discussions, the following remarks and recommendations were made:

- There should be raising of awareness about



Panel 3 (Justice, humanitarian situation, and human rights in Puntland) - From left: Shamso Sheekh Hassan, Lawyer; Mohamed Hared Farah, PL Deputy Attorney General; Faysal Khalif [Moderator], Senior Journalist; Nuur Isse Mohamed, PL Deputy Chief of Justice; Ismail Mohamed Warsame, PL Former Minister of Justice



Panel 4 (Youth, challenges and opportunities) - From left: Mohamed Dahir Aysane, Head of Media Association of Puntland; Liban Ahmed Shire, Executive Director of Horn Africa Research Center; Khadar Ahmed Mohamed [Moderator], Horn Africa Research Center; Ahmed Abdalla, Director General Ministry of Labour, Youth and Sports; Maryam Said Mohamed, Puntland Business Women Umbrella; Abdifatah Mohamed Sugulle, Executive Director of PSA

laws and policies and translating them into languages accessible to the people. There is a need to disseminate all information regarding laws and court cases within communities. This would help many people to keep abreast of the likely outcomes from court rulings in case they report their cases for trial of perpetrators.

- Adoption of one clear system of judgement. Today, judgment is done following xeer, sharia law and the secular law. There should be one clear law system and procedures to follow in order to increase chances of human rights cases having similar hearings in courts of law. People should be allowed to express their opinions freely without fear. This is what would enable many citizens to raise their voice on the existing acts of human rights violation.
- Raise awareness among traditional elders about human rights. There should be dialogue with traditional elders as regards human rights such that they are made to respect human rights and the danger of their violation.

4.4 Panel discussion 4: Youth, Challenges and Opportunities

Key messages

Unemployment was noted to be the biggest challenge affecting youths in Puntland and Somalia at large. The panel wholesomely contended that, the attention of politicians all around the globe is shifting towards youth and their role in shaping society. According to studies, over 70% of the Somali people are less than 30 years of age and this majority can either participate in rebuild Somalia or in destroying it.

The absence of basic economic infrastructure and a lack of social services fuel a high rate of unemployment among the young with 67% of Somali youths estimated to be unemployed. Puntland government has registered over 184 youth organizations and has established an umbrella organization to unite them. Panelists agreed that youths played a major role in the progress made in both developing and developed countries. They come up with innovations and creativity that boost economic growth and development. It is fundamental that Puntland youths create a platform to debate social problems as part of the solutions to unemployment. It was argued Somali youths now have somewhat adequate knowledge and skills which

they can use for entrepreneurship to foster economic growth and development and their standard of living in particular.

On the political participation question, emphasis was put on reasons preventing youths from joining politics which include (a) lack of quality education, (b) unsupportive political will, (c) exclusion from decision-making processes, and (d) lack of unity among youths.

It's essential that youth perspectives be included in peace-building processes and decision-making on peace and conflict. The inclusion and participation of young people enhances their capabilities and enables them to participate in the process of building peace and stability for the state.

It is worth mentioning that the inclusion of youths in peace building processes and decision-making processes will allow them to gain ownership of the policies that affect them, bring about a paradigmatic shift in the concept of the role of youth in conflict, which transforms them from being victims or instruments of violence to being active agents of peace building and social reconciliation.

All panelists agreed that there is a lack of social responsibility within Somalis. If this is worked on, it can allow everyone to take part in the development of Puntland and Somalia as a whole.

Open discussions and recommendations

During the open discussions involving the panel participants, the following remarks and recommendations were made:

- It is important to create clear and promising policies that will help to overcome the issues that trigger emigration, violence and youth unemployment. This can help to create a bigger young and vibrant labour force for the economy.
- The youth should be included in decision-making bodies and peace building processes to change the narrative that they are the victims. Eventually, it will enhance mentoring of leaders of tomorrow.
- Puntland should create a safe environment for youth and protect them from dangers of khat, robbery, and unemployment. The government should ensure that youths are kept actively engaged in economic activities and hence lowering their chances of participating in social evils like theft and robbery.
- Awareness campaigns are needed to inform



Panel 5 (Economic and trade development in Puntland) - From left: Mohamed Farah Isse, PL Former State Minister of Good Governance; Asli Duale, SIDRA BOD Chairperson; Abdirahman Hassan Yusuf, PL Deputy Minister of Commerce and Industries; Halimo Mohamed Mohamud, Chairperson of Puntland Business Women Umbrella



Panel 6 (Education and health in Puntland) - From left: Abdirahman Sheikhdon Ali, Head of Puntland Universities Association; Mohamed Ali Frah, DG of PL Ministry of Education; Absir Aw Yusuf, PL Minister of Education; Dr. Amina Jama [Moderator], Director of Research at SIDRA; Abdinasir Osman Uuke, PL Minister of Health; Abdirizak Abshir, Director of Primary Health Department of PL Ministry of Health

youth on the role they can play in society and how they can do so. This should be done at large scale in order to inspire youths to participate in the economic development process of Puntland and Somalia at large.

- The education sector should be improved to give youth skills and knowledge that they can use to contribute actively to the society and economy. There exists a skills mismatch between what is taught in colleges and universities and the skills actually needed in the labour market. There should be harmonization of the curriculums with the skills needed in the job market to avoid youth unemployment after school as well as encouraging self-employment.
- Advocacy should be made to traditional elders so that they give opportunities to youths and women in politics. This will also encourage youths to raise their voices and ideas necessary for the growth of Puntland State.

4.5 Panel 5: Economic and trade development in Puntland

Key messages

The economy of Puntland has been improving year by year but is highly affected by high levels of inflation and challenges of poor quality products supplied on the market although there are efforts by the government to improve on this. The panel dispelled the notion that process of goods used to be controlled by the central government by drawing attention to the problems that arose after the revolution and civil war. The central government paid close attention to quality and provided the necessary goods and services to its citizens. As one can expect, after the fall of the government, quality control, monitoring and evaluation, and price control. This led to a free market economy in which there was no government control as regards inflation. Eventually, it resulted into a fall in the value of the Somali Shillings in Puntland.

Though Puntland faces a lot of challenges, there is an incredible market leading to expansion and growth of trade in the past 20 years. The panel observed that Somali diaspora citizens played a key role in investment when they saw an open market where many services were needed. Also, the community was very keen to join businesses and they had the creativity that led to more and more businesses being created. Not only did banks contribute to the economy by providing loans and investments to the

community, but also donor agencies changed their aid from humanitarian to support for investment in business which further created a bigger space for the growth of the economy of Puntland.

The panel also pointed out that the shift of focus towards the fishing market was another achievement of Puntland government's, although Puntland has not yet reached its full capacity. According to the panelists, the fishing community is discouraged by fear of foreign ships targeting them because of piracy.

It was also noted that women play a vital role in business. Ms. Halima Mohamud, a panelist stressed the importance of women in Business. In Puntland, women own a majority of the business although their business are always small. They sell a variety of products such as meat, milk, vegetables, khat, etc. However, they do not receive the backup and investment given to men even though 65% of trade is carried out by women. Most of the women in Puntland engage in business to cover the needs of their families. To push their businesses from small to medium, they require knowledge, skills and increased investment in their businesses.

Open Discussions and Recommendations

During the open discussions, the participants asked important questions that led to the following remarks and recommendations:

- Business should improve on planning to help them exploit the existing opportunities in the market and expand their businesses. Puntland business lack necessary policies, models and plans to guide its development and thus they need to improve on this if they are to expand from SMEs to medium and large-scale businesses.
- Empowerment of the quality control office. The quality of merchandise is controlled by traders who decide what to import. This should be regulated by the quality control office. There are many expired or unhealthy goods entering Puntland because of lack of control.
- The entrepreneurs need financial resources to turn their ideas into reality. There is a need for banks, financial institutions and government agencies to support entrepreneurs such as in form of loans at lower interest to have higher access to capital in order to start and expand their businesses.
- Both women and youths need training and skills to apply in the market. This can enable

them to attract more customers in order to have successful businesses.

- Infrastructures like roads, ports and airports should be developed to enhance easy transportation of products from areas of plenty to market areas. This can increase the entrepreneurs' returns and encourage business growth

4.6 Panel 6: Education and health in Puntland

Key messages

It was observed that the health services in Puntland are still across all regions and some regions do not have large health centres at all although efforts are under way to overcome this. In her introduction to the panelists, Dr. Amina started with informing the panelists that the questions would be focusing on three areas: equity, quality and future of the two Ministries.

According to the panelists from the Health Ministry, there are regional hospitals and district hospitals, each with their own tasks and levels. Regional hospitals serve the people of each particular region with all the health services they might need, while district hospitals are smaller and more present even in places without regional hospitals. There has been an improvement in the health sector though still generally weak. A case in point, Karkaar and Bari used to be one region with some parts being unreachable but now everyone has access to a district hospital and to a regional referral hospital for big cases that the district hospital cannot handle. Another milestone that had been reached was the development of maternal care units in Bari intended to help pregnant women to give birth from their cities and avoid long journeys. In terms of funding, there are two major sources of finance for the ministry of health. Some funds come from government and others from

International NGOs. However, it is mostly International NGOs that fund or provide services to the ministries. There are services that are not yet there at all while others need improvement. Some medicine is not yet available for example for snake bites like Eyl and thus patients resort to traditional medicine for healing.

For health, it should still be noted that, prior to 1991, the service was provided by the government. After the collapse of the government until now, education finances are covered by (a) citizens, (b) international organizations and (c) government that covers 8% of the needs.

A comparison was made between education in 1990s and today. Panelists from the Ministry of Education revealed that, in 1990s, students who finished secondary school would go to Mogadishu for higher education. Now, there are over 734 primary schools, 796 secondary schools and 13 universities in Puntland. This change not only shows the progress of Puntland in terms of education, but also the services provided to students in their own regions, cities and towns. The farthest and least accessible regions of Puntland such as Alula and Baargaal have the same services as other cities. As a ministry, efforts have been made to cover each region's needs and 90% of the target needs have been achieved.

Most important to note is that, the needs for the education sector have been covered progressively. The ministry started with setting regulations to be followed after the fall of the central government of Somalia, the proceeded to overcoming challenges faced by students in academic institutions and now the focus is on the quality of the services. To provide quality, efforts were put in unifying the curriculum and having qualified teachers as well as centrally controlled examinations. All these efforts are underway and some of them have already been provided.



Panelists stand for a group photo during the second day of the Summer Dialogues



Panelists and participants take a group photo after panel discussion session on the third day of the Summer Dialogues

Annex 1 – Summer Dialogues Program – Friday 3rd August 2018

<i>Xiriiryayaal Master of Ceremonies: (1) Mr. Jaamac Debaraani; (2) Mrs. Fardowsa Gambol</i>		
Waqtiga / Time	Mawduuca / Topic	Soojeediyaha / Presenter / Panelists
Friday, 3 Aug 08 – 09 am	Registration	
Friday, 3 Aug 09.00 – 09.10 am	Soodhoweyn iyo Aqrin Agendaha Welcoming Remarks	Mr. Jama Debarani Mrs. Fardowsa Gambol
Friday, 3 Aug 09.10 – 09.20 am	Quran	Sh Mohamed Omar
Friday, 3 Aug 09.20 – 09.35 am	Soojeedin ujeedlka shirka iyo kalmada soodhoweynta martida Presentation on Summit Objectives	Mr. Guled Salah, SIDRA Director
Friday, 3 Aug 09.35 – 09.45 am	Kalmadda maalgaliyayaasha shirka (Diakonia) Remarks from the Sponsors	Mrs. Muna Yusuf, Head of Diakonia, PL Office
Friday, 3 Aug 09.45 – 10.00 am	Soojeedin sidii lagu aasaasay PL Presentation on Puntland establishment Journey	Mr. Abbas Ahmed, PL Founders
Friday, 3 Aug 10.00 – 10.15 am	Horumarka Puntland lagasoo bilaabo xilligii aasaaska Puntland in Progress: Towards Stability and Development	Mr. Mohamed Yusuf, Senior Researcher and Head of PL Human Rights Defenders Office
Friday, 3 Aug 10.15 – 10.25 am	Kalmada mid ka mid ah Xildhibaanadii ugu horeeyay PL Remarks by one of the longest serving MPs of PL	MP Saadiq Abshir
Friday, 3 Aug 10.25 – 10.35 am	Kalmada Isimada Remarks from the Deputy Prime Minister of Somalia	H.E Mahad Gulaid
Friday, 3 Aug 10.35 – 10.45 am	Kalmada Guddoomiyaha Baarlamaanka Remarks from PL Parliament Speaker	Hon. Ahmed Ali Hashi
Friday, 3 Aug 10.45 – 11.00 am	Furitaanka rasmiga ee shirka ee Madaxweynaha Official Opening Remarks by the President	H.E Dr Abdiweli Mohamed Ali
Friday, 3 Aug 11.00 am – 02.00 pm	Salaada Jimcaha iyo qadada Juma Prayer and Lunch Break	
Friday, 3 Aug 02.00 pm – 03.00 pm	Doodda 1aad: maxaa horumar laga gaaray hannaanka dimuqraadiyada PL, tayaynta hay'adaha dawladeed iyo kaalinta PL ee dib yagleelida dawladnimada Soomaaliya? Maxayse yihiin caqabadaha haysta? Maxaa xal noqon kara? Panel discussion 1: What are the major achievements (and challenges) made (faced) against (1) PL Democratization Process; (2) Development of Public Institutions and (3) the role of PL in rebuilding the (transitional) Federal State of Somalia? What could be the way forward?	Panelists: Mohamed Yusuf (Moderator) - Senior Researcher and Head of PL Human Rights Defenders Office; Abdirashid M Hersi - Minister of Fisheries / Former Parliament Speaker; Shamso Sh Hassan – Lawyaer; Jamila Said Muse - Former Minister; Dr Mohamed Dahir Afrah - Historian
Friday, 3 Aug 03.00 pm – 03.30 pm	Soojeedin xaaladda nabadgelyo ee PL Presentation on PL Security: Progress and Challenges	Mr. Abdirahman Yusuf Farah Former Director of PL Security Services Agency
Dhamaadka maalintii 1aad End of Day 1		

Annex 1 – Summer Dialogues Program – Saturday 4th August 2018

Waqtiga / Time	Mawduuca / Topic	Soojeediya / Presenter / Panelists
Saturday, 4 Aug 08.00 – 08.30 am	Isdiiwaangalin Registration	
Saturday, 4 Aug 08.30 – 09.00 am	Soojeedin ku saabsan cilimibaaris ka hadlaysa fahanka dadweynaha ee musuqmaasuqa iyo islaxisaabtanka Presentation on Public Perception, attitude and experience on corruption and accountability	Dr Bashir Sh Mohamed Senior Researcher
Saturday, 4 Aug 09.00 – 09.30 am	Kaalinta caddaaladda ee la dagaalanka musuqa. The role of Judiciary in combating corruption in PL	Sh Mohamed Omar Member of High Council of Judiciary in PL
Saturday, 4 Aug 09.30 – 10.30 am	Doodda 2aad: Hufnaanta, islaxisaabtanka iyo la dagaalanka musuqmaasuqa hay'adaha dawladda Panel Discussion 2: Transparency, Accountability and Fight Against Corruption	Panelists Abdullahi Farah Mire (Moderator) - University of Malaia; Dr Bashir Sh Mohamed - Senior Researcher; Abdurahman Gureye - Director, PL Good Governance and Anti-Corruption Bureau; Sh Mohamed Omar - Member of High Council of Judiciary in PL Abdulkadir Abdikhadar - East Africa University
Saturday, 4 Aug 10.30 – 11.00 am	Soojeedin Xaaladda Cadaaladda ee PL Presentation on PL Justice: Challenges and Opportunities	Salim Said Salim - Senior Lawyer and Consultant
Saturday, 4 Aug 11.00 – 11.15 am	Bareeg iyo Quraac Break and refreshment	
Saturday, 4 Aug 11.15 – 11.45 am	Soojeedin Xaaladda Bini'aadanimo iyo Xuquuqul Insaanka PL Presentation on Humanitarian situation and Human Rights in PL	Mohamed Yusuf - Senior Researcher and Head of PL Human Rights Defenders Office
Saturday, 4 Aug 11.45 am – 12.45 pm	Doodda 3aad: Xaaladda Caddaalada, Bini'aadanimada iyo Xuquuqul Insaanka Panel discussion 3 on Justice, humanitarian situation and human rights in PL	Panelists: Faysal Khaliif (Moderator) - Senior Journalist; Mohamed Yusuf - Senior Researcher and Head of PL Human Rights Defenders Office; Ismail Mohamed Warsame - Former PL Minister of Justice; Nuur Isse Mohamed - PL Deputy Chief of Justice; Mohamed Hared - PL Deputy Attorney General
Saturday, 4 Aug 12.45 pm – 2.00 pm	Salaadda Duhur iyo qado Duhur Prayer and Lunch Break	
Saturday, 4 Aug 2.00 pm – 3.30 pm	Doodda 4aad: xaaladda dhalinyarada, caqabadaha iyo fursadaha Panel discussion 4 on Youth challenges and opportunities	Panelists: Khadar Ahmed Mohamoud (Moderator) - Horn Africa Research Center; Liban Ahmed Shire - Horn Africa Research Center; Mariam Said Mohamed - Puntland Women Business Umbrella; Ahmed Abdalla Mohamoud - Director General, Ministry of Labor, Youth and Sports; Mohamed Dahir Caysane - Head of Media Association of Puntland (MAP); Abdifatah Sugle - Executive Director, PSA

Annex 1 – Summer Dialogues Program – Sunday 5th August 2018

Waqtiga / Time	Mawduuca / Topic	Soojeediyaha / Presenter / Panelists
Sunday, 5 Aug 08.00 – 08.30 am	Isdiiwaangalin Registration	
Sunday, 5 Aug 08.30 – 09.00 am	Soojeedin ku saabsan xallinta khilaafaadka bulshooyinka kasoo kabanaya colaadaha Presentation on Conflict resolution in Post-Conflict Societies	Diplomat Ahmed Sheekh Mohamud Former Ambassador and Lecturer at PSU
Sunday, 5 Aug 09.00 – 10.00 am	Doodda 5aad: Xaaladda dhaqaalaha iyo ganacsiga PL. Panel discussion 5: the economic and Trade development	Panelists Asli Duale (Moderator) - SIDRA BOD Chairperson; Mohamed Farah Isse Gashan - Former Minister; Abdirahman Hassan Yusuf - PL Deputy Minister of Commerce; Halimo Mohamoud Mohamed - Former Minister and Chairperson of Puntland Women Business Umbrella
Sunday, 5 Aug 10.00 – 10.30 am	Soojeedin ku saabsan xaaladda waxbarasho ee PL Presentation on PL Education development	Mohamed Ali Farah - Director General, PL Ministry of Education
Sunday, 5 Aug 10.30 – 10.45 am	Break and Refreshment	
Sunday, 5 Aug 10.45 – 11.15 am	Soojeedin ku saabsan xaaladda caafimaad ee PL Presentation 6 on PL Health development	Mr. Abdirisak Abshir Hersi - Ministry of Health
Sunday, 5 Aug 11.15 am – 12.30 pm	Panel discussion 6: Education and health in Puntland	Panelists: Dr Amina Jama (Moderator) - Director of Research, SIDRA; Dr Abdinasir Uuke - Minister of Health, PL; Abshir Aw Yusuf - Minister of Education, PL; Mohamed Ali Farah - DG, Ministry of Education; Abdirahman Sheikhdon Ali - Head of Universities Association and Head of GTEC; Abdirizak Abshir - Director of Primary Health, Ministry of Health

Annex 2 – Summer Dialogues Speakers



H.E. Mahdi Mohamed Gulaid (Khadar) - Deputy Prime Minister, Federal Government of Somalia



H.E. Dr Abdiweli Mohamed Ali - President of Puntland State, Former Prime Minister of Somalia



H.E. Ahmed Ali Hashi - Speaker of the Puntland State Parliament



H.E. Abdirahman Abdulle - Minister of Labour, Youth and Sports, Puntland



Hon. Dr Abdinasir Uke - Puntland Minister of Health



Hon. Asbhir Aw Yusuf - Puntland Minister of Education



Hon. Aydid Saleban Hashi - Jubaland Minister of Environment



Hon. Abdirahman Hassan Yusuf - Puntland Deputy Minister of Commerce



Sadiq Abshir Garaad - Puntland Member of Parliament



Ismail Mohamed Warsame - Former Minister of Justice, Puntland



Ali Haji Warsame - Former Minister of Education, Puntland



Ahmed Abdallah Mohamoud - Director General, Puntland Ministry of Labour, Youth and Sports



Mohamed Ali Farah - Director General, Ministry of Education, Puntland



Nur Isse Mohamed - Deputy Chief of Justice, Puntland



Mohamed Hared Farah, Puntland Deputy Attorney General



Abdirisaaq Abshir Hirsi - Director Of Primary Health Department, Puntland Ministry of Health

Annex 2 – Summer Dialogues Speakers



Abdirahaman Yusuf Farah - Former Deputy Minister of Public Works and Former Director of Puntland Security Service Agency



Mr Mohamed Yusuf - Senior Researcher and Head of Puntland Human Rights Defender's Office



Mrs Muna Yusuf - Head of Diakonia, Puntland Office



Mr Abbas Ahmed - Senior Researcher



Sheekh Mohamed Omar - Member of Somali Higher Judiciary Council



Mr Gulled Salah Barre - Executive Director, SIDRA and Rector of Royal University of Business and Technology



Shamso Sheikh Hassan - Lawyer



Mohamed Dahir Afrah - Historian and Head of Somali Independent Constitution Review Committee



Dr Bashir Sheik Mohamed - Senior Researcher



Abdullahi Farah Mire - Student at University of Malal



Abdirihman Ali Gureeye - Director of Puntland Good Governance and Anti-Corruption Bureau



Abdulkadir Abdi khadar - Director of International Relations, East Africa Research Centre



Salim Said Salim - Senior Lawyer and Consultant



Faysal Khalif - Senior Journalist



Khadar Ahmed Mohamed - Member of Horn African Research Centre



Liban Ahmed Shire - Head of Horn African Research Centre

Annex 2 – Summer Dialogues Speakers



Mariam Said Ahmed - Member of Puntland Women Business Umbrella



Mohamed Dahir Caysane - Head of Media Association of Puntland (MAP)



Abdi-Fatah Mohamed Sugule - Director of Puntland Students Association



Diplomat Ahmed Sheik Mohamed - Lecturer at PSU, Former Ambassador (USA)



Asli Duale - Chairperson of SIDRA Board of Directors



Mohamed Farah Isse - Former State Minister of Good Governance



Halimo Mohamoud Mohamed - Chairperson of Puntland Businesswomen Umbrella and Former Deputy Minister of Women Development



Dr Amina Jama - SIDRA institute Director of Research



Abdirihman Sheikdon Ali - Rector of GTEC and Head of Puntland Universities Association



Abdiiaziz Xildhiban - Former Spokesman of Ministry of Internal Security, Federal Government of Somalia

2018 Summer Dialogues

Theme *“Puntland State at Twenty: Transformation to Stability & Good Governance”*



2018 Summer Dialogues was sponsored and supported by:

